

C. RAY NAGIN
MAYOR

CITY OF NEW ORLEANS

C. ELLIOTT PERKINS
EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission Minutes: Meeting of April 9, 2009

The New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission held its regular meeting on Thursday, April 9, 2009 at 9:30 A.M. in the City Council Chambers, 1300 Perdido Street.

The meeting was called to order at 9:30 a.m., by the Chairman, Mr. Jesse LeBlanc

Roll Call:

Members present: Jesse LeBlanc, Chairman
Marlene Jaffe, Vice Chairman
Frank Cole
Stephen Peychaud
Alonzo Knox
Lynne Stern
John Deveney
Charles Allen

Members absent: Scott Sewell
James Perry
Dr. Troy Scroggins
Lynn Worley
Jim Kitto

At the beginning of the meeting, there were eight members present constituting a quorum.

The chairman stated the rules and procedures in which the meeting would be conducted.

I. Minutes of the March 13, 2009 meeting.

Mrs. Jaffe made a motion to approve the minutes with the corrections she submitted to the staff. The motion, seconded by Mrs. Stern, passed unanimously.

II. Report of HDLC appeals to City Council by Elliott Perkins, Executive Director.

This item was deferred to the end of the meeting.



III. Reinventing the Crescent: The Riverfront Plan: City of New Orleans, owner; Eskew + Dumez + Ripple, applicant/ architect. Proposal to redevelop the riverfront.

Mr. Allen Eskew made a presentation of the proposal to redevelop the downtown portion of the Riverfront. The Commissioners asked several questions regarding the limited access to the new parks, the use of the wharf facility for concerts and the long term management of the park. The Commission then stated conceptual support for the proposal, but encouraged the designer to increase access to the park.

IV. Landmark Nominations

A. 1501 Canal - Texaco bldg.

The staff stated that this item was placed on the agenda in error. The building is located within the boundaries of the Central Business District and should be heard by the CBDHDL.

B. 2425 Canal - Caribe Building

F. 4140 Canal - Automotive Life

Toni DiMaggio, president of Docomomo/Nola stated that they would like to defer items B & F in order to work with the owners who were opposed to nomination.

Mr. Cole then made a motion to defer items B & F for 60 days. The motion, seconded by Mr. Peychaud, passed unanimously.

C. 2640 Canal – IBM

D. 2650 Canal - Whitney

E. 3700 Canal- Grace Episcopal

G. 4176 Canal - Singer Sewing Bldg.

H. 4841 Canal - Hope Mausoleum

Mr. Cole made a motion to nominate items C, D, E, G, & H for landmark study. The nominations were seconded by Mr. Allen and Mr. Peychaud

V. OLD BUSINESS WORK APPLICATIONS

A. 4000 St. Claude Avenue: Larry Willis, owner/ applicant. Proposal for a one story addition.

A representative from the Bywater Neighborhood Association stated that they approved of the proposal in concept, but would like the ARC to review the details of the renovation. Mr. Deveney made a motion for conceptual approval with the details to be worked out with the staff and the ARC. The motion, seconded by Mr. Knox, passed unanimously.

B. 824-26 Elmira Avenue: Ali R. Mesbah, owner/applicant. Proposal for the construction of a single-story, two family residence.

Mrs. Stern made a motion to approve the application. The motion, seconded by Mr. Allen, passed unanimously.

- C. 5300 Chartres Street: Emile Dumesnil, owner/ applicant. Proposal to construct a tennis court, 10' high chain link fence and masonry wall.

Mr. Allen made a motion for conceptual approval subject to the application being allowed by zoning. The motion, seconded by Mr. Peychaud, passed unanimously.

VI. NEW BUSINESS WORK APPLICATIONS

- A. 1514 Melpomene Street: Rita Olmo, owner; KVS Architecture and Associates c/o K. Vaughan Sollberger, Jr., applicant/architect. Proposal for demolition and new construction of a two-story multi-use building.

Mrs. Jaffe made a motion to approve the application. The motion, seconded by Mr. Knox, passed unanimously.

- B. 6028 Chartres Street: Carl Doescher, owner/ applicant. Proposal to install recess mounted vinyl windows at the side elevations and install 36" high metal picket handrails at balcony.

The Commission asked the owner why he was proposing to install metal pickets rather than wood. The owner stated that wood railings rot and would require increased maintenance and eventual replacement. The staff requested that, if approved, the metal railings be of simple metal pickets. Mrs. Stern made a motion to allow the metal handrail. The motion, seconded by Mr. Allen, passed unanimously.

Mr. Allen made a motion to allow the recessed vinyl windows provided wood screens are installed. The motion, seconded by Mr. Peychaud passed with everyone voting in favor of the motion except for Mrs. Stern. Mr Cole then changed his vote to against the motion. The motion failed to pass. Mr. Allen then withdrew his motion and Mr. Peychaud withdrew his second.

Mr. Allen made a motion to deny the proposal to install recess mounted vinyl windows at the side elevations, the motion, seconded by Mr. Peychaud, passed unanimously.

- C. 2119 Coliseum Street: Trinity Church c/o Mathew Holt, owner; John Williams Architects c/o John C. Williams, applicant/architect. Proposal for demolition of existing two-story rear addition, restoration of front façade and new construction of a three-story rear addition.

Mrs. Stern made a motion to approve the application with ARC recommendations and details to be worked out with the Staff. The motion, seconded by Mr. Knox failed to pass with Mr. Cole opposed. Mr. Cole made a motion to defer the application and have the applicant go back to the ARC. The motion, seconded by Mrs. Jaffe was eventually withdrawn by Mr. Cole. Mrs. Stern then made a motion to grant conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the staff level. The motion, seconded by Mr. Knox, passed unanimously.

- D. 922 Teche Street: Pride of Algiers Lodge #102 F. & A.M, owner; Lonnie Hewitt, Jr., applicant; Hewitt- Washington & Associates, architect. Proposal for a 4, 696 square foot addition and exterior alterations.

Mr. Peychaud made a motion for conceptual approval. The motion, seconded by Mrs. Stern, passed unanimously.

VII. OLD BUSINESS DEMOLITION APPLICATIONS

- A. 501-21 Forstall Street: Sheba Investments, owner/ applicant. Proposal for demolition.

Mr. Peychaud made a motion to defer the matter for thirty days. The motion, seconded by Mr. Cole, passed unanimously.

- B. 1719-21 Orleans Avenue: Denise D. Salvant, owner/ applicant. Proposal for demolition.

Mr. Peychaud made a motion to defer the matter thirty days to allow time for the ARC to review the redevelopment plans. The motion, seconded by Mr. Knox, passed unanimously.

VIII. NEW BUSINESS DEMOLITION APPLICATIONS

- A. 1312 St. Bernard Avenue: Victor Dawkins, owner; New Orleans Demolition Service, LLC, applicant, contractor. Proposal for demolition and construction of a two story residence.

The staff stated that an application for demolition put forth by the City appeared before the Commission in October of 2008. The application was denied and the owner cited for Demolition by Neglect. The current application was submitted by the owner.

Mr. Peychaud made a motion to begin the standard thirty day layover period and requested that the owner to have their redevelopment plans reviewed by the ARC. The motion, seconded by Mr. Knox, passed unanimously.

- B. 916 Pacific Avenue: CGH Partners, owner/applicant. Proposal for demolition.

Mr. Cole made a motion to defer the matter for thirty days in order to allow the owner, who was not present, an opportunity to speak to the Commission. The motion, seconded by Mr. Deveney, passed unanimously.

- C. 1012-14 N. Rocheblave Street: Emanuel Mathieu, owner/ applicant. Proposal for demolition.

Mr. Knox made a motion to allow the demolition, provided front elevation is retained, and to wave the standard thirty day layover. The motion, seconded by Mr. Peychaud, passed unanimously. Mr. Deveney then requested that this property be sent back to adjudication for demolition by neglect fines.

- D. 1009-11 N. Claiborne Avenue: Full Gospel Church of God in Christ, owner/ applicant. Proposal for demolition.

Ms. Stern made a motion to defer the matter for thirty days and requested that the owner be present at the next hearing. The motion, seconded by Mrs. Jaffe, passed unanimously. Mrs. Stern made a motion to cite the building for Demolition by Neglect. The motion, seconded by Mr. Knox, passed unanimously.

IX. OLD BUSINESS RETENTION APPLICATIONS

- A. 3131- 33 Dauphine Street: Matilda Alberny & Gustavo Dupre, owner/ applicant. Request for the retention of wind turbines.

Mr. Deveney made a motion to deny the application. The motion, seconded by Mrs. Jaffe, passed unanimously.

- B. 3038 Royal Street: Roger Martin, owner/ applicant. Request for the retention of a wind turbine and the removal of ridge tiles.

Mr. Deveney made a motion to defer the matter for thirty days. The motion, seconded by Mrs. Stern, passed unanimously.

- C. 6022-24 Burgundy Street: Lillian Piazza, owner/ applicant. Request for the retention of vinyl siding, soffit and fascia and the removal of ridge tiles and half round gutters.

Mr. Peychaud made a motion to allow the retention of the siding on the sides of the building but deny its retention on the front elevation. The motion, seconded by Mr. Knox, passed unanimously.

Mrs. Jaffe made a motion to allow the retention of the removal of the ridge tiles. The motion, seconded by Mr. Peychaud, passed unanimously.

Mrs. Jaffe made a motion to allow the removal of the ½ round gutters. The motion, seconded by Mr. Peychaud, failed to pass with Mrs. Stern voting against. No action was taken on this item.

Mr. Peychaud made a motion to allow the vinyl soffits and fascia at the side elevations. The motion, seconded by Mr. Knox, passed unanimously.

- D. 1015 Congress Street: Robert Couch, owner/ applicant. Request for the retention of security doors that do not fit the opening.

Mr. Deveney made a motion to deny the application. The motion, seconded by Mrs. Stern, passed unanimously.

- E. 1032 Franklin Avenue: Pauline Draughan, owner/ applicant. Request for the retention of three-tab roof shingles, decorative security door, and satellite dish and the removal of ridge tiles.

Mrs. Stern made a motion to deny the application. The motion, seconded by Mr. Deveney, passed unanimously.

- F. 1428 Kerlerec Street: Alton Mims, owner/ applicant. Request for reconsideration for the retention of an oval lite door.

Mr. Peychaud made a motion to deny retention. The motion, seconded by Mr. Cole, passed unanimously.

X. NEW BUSINESS RETENTION APPLICATIONS

- A. 3021-23 St. Thomas Street: Shannon Smith Jinks, owner/applicant. Request for the retention of the first window, right side elevation, installed in deviation of approved Certificate of Appropriateness.

Ms. Stern made a motion to allow retention. The motion, seconded by Mr. Cole, passed unanimously.

- B. 3040 Marais Street: Kemp Johnson, owner/ applicant. Request for the retention of surface mounted vinyl windows, with a reduced opening at side elevations, a metal door at front elevation and the installation of HardiPlank between piers.

Mr. Cole made a motion to defer the matter for thirty days. The motion, seconded by Mrs. Stern, passed unanimously.

- C. 2335-37 Rousseau Street: Isabell Locket, owner; James E. Burse, applicant. Request for the retention of handrails installed in deviation of approved drawings.

Mr. Knox made a motion to allow the retention of the handrails provided they are painted to match the existing porch handrails. The motion, seconded by Mr. Peychaud, passed unanimously.

- D. 4708-10 Burgundy Street: Sarah Allen, owner; NENA, applicant. Request for the retention of recessed mounted vinyl windows at the side elevation and the installation of of inappropriate handrails, landing and stairs.

Mr. Knox made a motion to deny the installation of the inappropriate handrails, landing and stairs and to allow the retention of the windows provided the owner installed wooden screens. The motion, seconded by Mr. Cole, passed unanimously.

- E. 1822 Clio Street: Louis Kennedy, Jr. owner/applicant. Request for the retention of brown 3-tab roof shingles installed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Mr. Cole made a motion to deny the application. The motion, seconded by Mr. Deveney, failed to pass with Mr. Peychaud and Mr. Knox voting against the motion. There was no action taken on this application.

- F. 3021-21½ Burgundy Street: Jesse Farmer, owner/ applicant. Request for the retention of surface mounted vinyl windows at side elevation, wind turbine and the removal of ridge tiles.

Mr. Deveney made a motion to deny the removal of the ridge tiles. The motion, seconded by Mr. Knox, passed unanimously.

Mr. Deveney made a motion to deny the retention of the wind turbine. The motion, seconded by Mr. Knox, passed unanimously.

Mr. Deveney made a motion to deny retention of the first two windows at the right side elevation, closest to the street, and replace them with wood 6/6 windows and to allow the retention of the remainder of the surface mounted vinyl windows at the side elevations, provided that the windows are recessed and wood window screens are installed. The motion, seconded by Mr. Knox, passed unanimously.

- G. 312 Olivier Street: John G. Autin, owner/applicant. Gulf South Solar, contractor. Request for the retention of solar photo-voltaic modules and associated electrical boxes installed in deviation of the system design package submitted to HDLC staff for review and approval.

Mr. Cole made a motion to deny the retention and completion of the photo voltaic panels and allow their relocation to a less visible location approved by the staff. The motion, seconded by Mrs. Stern, passed unanimously.

- H. 826 Desire Street: Andrew Clark, owner/ applicant. Request for the retention of brown roof shingles and the removal of ridge tiles.

Mr. Peychaud made a motion to allow the retention of the roof because it was installed during the roof replacement amnesty period in place for one calendar year following Hurricane Katrina. The motion, seconded by Mr. Knox, passed unanimously.

- I. 532 Fourth Street: Monroe Fleming, owner. Martha F. Moore, applicant. Request for the retention of handicapped ramp installed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Mrs. Stern made a motion to allow the retention of the handicapped ramp, provided it meets code. The motion, seconded by Mr. Knox, passed unanimously.

- J. 3721-23 N. Rampart Street: Lisa Johnson, owner; George Thiel, applicant. Request for the retention of k- style gutters.

A neighbor appeared and stated their support for the owners of 3721-23 N. Rampart Street and the work they had done to the building since the storm. Mr. Deveney made a motion to allow retention of the gutters. The motion, seconded by Mrs. Stern, passed unanimously.

- K. 627-29 Philip Street: Demetra George, owner/applicant. Next Generation Homes, Adonis B. Woods, contractor. Request for the retention of surface mounted vinyl windows installed in deviation of approved drawings.

Mr. Deveney made a motion to allow the retention of the windows installed in deviation of the approved drawings provided the contractor continues to work with the staff to correct the trim. The motion, seconded by Mr. Peychaud, passed unanimously.

- L. 5201 Dauphine Street: Troy Lawrence, owner; April Lawrence applicant. Request for retention of two windows removed and patched with concrete block, five windows removed and replaced with glass block, vinyl windows at rear building, two windows removed at rear building and closed in with plywood, and inappropriate front doors.

Mr. Peychaud made a motion to defer the application. The motion, seconded by Mrs. Jaffe, Passed unanimously.

- M. 2731 Tchoupitoulas Street: Cooke Holdings, LLC, owner; Diane Cooke, applicant. Request for the retention of stucco, applied by previous owner, at all elevations without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

The staff noted that the building was purchased with the violation in place. Mrs. Jaffe made a motion to allow retention of the stucco. The motion, seconded by Mrs. Stern, passed unanimously.

- N. 730-32 Independence Street: Dimitris Damvrogianis, owner/ applicant. Request for the retention of surface mounted vinyl windows.

Mrs. Jaffe made a motion to deny the application. The motion died due to a lack of a second. Mr. Knox made a motion to defer the matter for thirty days to allow time for a site visit. The motion, seconded by Mr. Peychaud, passed unanimously.

- O. 1325-27 Feliciana Street: John Parker, Jr., owner/ applicant. Request for the retention of black plexiglass installed at front elevation.

Mr. Deveney made a motion to deny the application. The motion, seconded by Mrs. Jaffe, passed unanimously.

- P. 1121 Clouet Street: Kimberly Benn, owner/ applicant. Request for the retention of leaded glass door, batten shutters, and wood gate.

Mr. Deveney made a motion to deny the application and allow twelve months for the violations to be corrected. The motion, seconded by Mr. Peychaud, passed unanimously.

- Q. 1239-41 Desire Street: Progressive Development Service, LLC, owner/ applicant. Request for the reconsideration for the removal of ridge tiles.

Staff requested this application be deferred until the next meeting; Mr. Peychaud made a motion to defer the application. The motion, seconded by Mr. Deveney, passed unanimously.

- R. 2131 & 2133 Orleans Avenue: Spencer Smith, owner/ applicant. Request for the reconsideration for the retention of the demolition of two buildings.

The owner appeared at the hearing and stated that he did not demolish the buildings following hurricane Katrina but simply removed the debris of collapsed buildings. The owner then agreed to have his redevelopment plans reviewed by the ARC. Mr. Peychaud made a motion to allow retention of the demolition provided

HDLC approved fencing is installed and the redevelopment plans are reviewed by the ARC. The motion, seconded by Mr. Knox, passed unanimously.

XI. DEMOLITION BY NEGLECT

- A. 433-35 Atlantic Avenue
Mrs. Jaffe made a motion to cite. The motion, seconded by Mr. Knox, passed unanimously.
- B. 2500 Chippewa Street/ 636 Second Street
Mr. Deveney made a motion to cite. The motion, seconded by Mr. Knox, passed unanimously.
- C. 1359 Constance Street
Mr. Deveney made a motion to cite. The motion, seconded by Mr. Knox, passed unanimously.
- D. 1372 Constance Street
Mrs. Stern made a motion to defer the matter for thirty days. The motion, seconded by Mr. Peychaud passed unanimously.
- E. 2119 Constance Street
Mr. Cole made a motion to cite. The motion, seconded by Mr. Knox, passed unanimously.
- F. 309-11 Homer Street
Mrs. Stern made a motion to cite. The motion, seconded by Mr. Knox, passed unanimously.
- G. 1450 Josephine Street
Mr. Peychaud made a motion to defer the matter for thirty days. The motion, seconded by Mr. Knox, passed unanimously.
- H. 3141 Laurel Street
Mrs. Jaffe made a motion to cite. The motion, seconded by Mrs. Stern, passed unanimously.
- I. 3146-48 Laurel Street
Mrs. Stern made a motion to cite. The motion, seconded by Mrs. Jaffe, passed unanimously.
- J. 3419 Laurel Street
Mrs. Jaffe made a motion to cite. The motion, seconded by Mrs. Stern, passed unanimously.
- K. 3340-42 Magazine Street
Mrs. Stern made a motion to cite. The motion, seconded by Mr. Deveney, passed unanimously.

- L. 512 Pelican Avenue
Mr. Knox made a motion to cite. The motion, seconded by Mr. Peychaud passed unanimously.
- M. 1123 Prytania Street
Mrs. Jaffe made a motion to cite. The motion, seconded by Mrs. Stern, passed unanimously
- N. 1517 Terpsichore Street
Mr. Peychaud made a motion to cite. The motion, seconded by Mr. Knox passed unanimously.
- O. 633 Washington Avenue
Mr. Deveney made a motion to cite. The motion, seconded by Mr. Peychaud passed unanimously.
- P. 4725 Dauphine Street
Mr. Knox made a motion to cite. The motion, seconded by Mr. Peychaud passed unanimously.
- Q. 5118 Dauphine Street
Mr. Knox made a motion to cite. The motion, seconded by Mr. Deveney passed unanimously.
- R. 1509-11 Louisa Street
Mrs. Jaffe made a motion to cite. The motion, seconded by Mrs. Stern, passed unanimously
- S. 5120 Dauphine Street
Mrs. Jaffe made a motion to cite. The motion, seconded by Mrs. Stern, passed unanimously
- T. 1929 N. Rampart Street
Mr. Knox made a motion to cite. The motion, seconded by Mr. Deveney passed unanimously.
- U. 1306 St. Bernard Avenue
Mr. Knox made a motion to cite. The motion, seconded by Mr. Deveney passed unanimously.
- V. 3424 St. Claude Avenue
Mr. Knox made a motion to cite. The motion, seconded by Mr. Peychaud passed unanimously.
- W. 3220 St. Claude Avenue
Mr. Knox made a motion to cite. The motion, seconded by Mr. Deveney passed unanimously.